

### COCOA CASE STUDIES

- Gender inequality in cocoa farming in Nigeria
- **▶** Gender inequality in cocoa farming in Brazil
- Gender inequality in cocoa farming in Ivory Coast
- **▶** Gender inequality in Indonesian cocoa production



### **GENDER INEQUALITY IN COCOA FARMING IN NIGERIA**

Oxfam visited five communities near llesa in Nigeria's Osun state to speak with women cocoa growers about the particular challenges they face in a supply chain that feeds some of the largest chocolate manufacturers in the world. Although they do not employ or control them directly, companies like Mars, Nestle, and Mondelez depend on the hard work of these farmers. But Oxfam's scorecard highlights how corporate policies and standards that may promote equal opportunities and treatment in the workforce have not trickled down to the women growers who supply these companies with their most precious ingredients. Following is a summary of what Oxfam learned about working conditions for women in this pocket of Nigeria—a country that ranks fourth in the global production of cocoa beans.



# THE STANDS

### Cocoa in Nigeria

In 2010/2011, Nigeria produced an estimated 240,000 tons of beans. About 85 percent of the country's cocoa is exported as beans, mostly to the EU. Belgium, UK, Germany and the Netherlands are the largest consumers. Recently, U.S. cocoa imports from Nigeria have been trending upwards and were estimated at \$40 million in 2010.

Nigerian cocoa growers supply some of the biggest chocolate producing companies in the world including Mars, Nestle and Mondelez for much loved products such as M&M's, Oreos, and KitKat.

Even though cocoa has been produced in Nigeria for more than a century<sup>3</sup> the cocoa industry has suffered from years of neglect – between 2001 and 2005, the Nigerian government devoted less than 2 percent of its total spending to the agriculture sector.<sup>4</sup> However there are signs that things could be looking up – in 2011, the Nigerian minister of agriculture announced plans to encourage a near doubling of production by making new seeds and fertilizers accessible to farmers<sup>5</sup>.

Cocoa in Nigeria is largely produced on small farms. Yet while chocolate companies post healthy profits, Nigeria's many small holder cocoa farmers struggle to earn a living in communities that have neither running water nor electricity. A 2007 field survey of cocoa farming households in Ondo, Nigeria's top cocoa-producing state, found 57% of households were food insecure.<sup>6</sup>

Women farmers face a daily struggle with inequality. Cocoa growers told us women are often only hired for lower paying work while men do some of the more physically demanding jobs that command a higher wage. And sometimes, even when men and women do the same jobs, men earn more for that work. Women also told us they have unequal access to the essentials, such as credit and land that would allow them to increase their harvests. And while agricultural training is rarely offered, when it is, other demands on their time can keep women from attending the sessions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ICCO Quarterly Bulletin of Cocoa Statistics, Vol. XXXVIII, No. 3, Cocoa year 2011/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://agriexchange.apeda.gov.in/marketreport/Reports/ Nigeria cocoa production report.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Hamzat R.A., A.O Olaiya, R.A. Sanusi and A. R. Adedeji. 2006. State of Cocoa Growing, Quality and Research in Nigeria: Need for intervention. A technical presentation at the Biannual Partnership Programme of the World Cocoa Foundation, Brussels, Belgium. Distinct Global Concepts Company (DGCC), Lagos, Nigeria.

http://usaidlandtenure.net/sites/default/files/country-profiles/full-reports/
USAID\_Land\_Tenure\_Niger\_Profile.pdf, page 1

 $<sup>^5</sup>$  http://www.bloomberg.com/news/print/2011-08-05/nigeria-targets-annual-cocoa-production-of-700-000-metric-tons-by-2015.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> http://www.arpnjournals.com/jabs/research papers/rp 2009/jabs 0909 147.pdf

### SETIND THE BRANDS

In spite of these obstacles, women cocoa farmers are among the most entrepreneurial people you will meet, and many are determined to marshal their resources so they can send their children to school and build a more prosperous future. Matched with corporate attention and investment, the drive and hard work of these women could pay substantial dividends for their communities and the companies that rely on the beans they produce.



### Hard work for low and unequal pay

Chocolate companies are thriving globally, agriculture accounts for an estimated 40 percent<sup>7</sup> of Nigeria's gross domestic product and cocoa is the second largest foreign exchange earner behind oil<sup>8</sup>. But for many of the small-scale farmers in this region of Nigeria, cocoa production doesn't mean handsome profits. Some of the farmers we spoke with reported current harvests as small as 50 KG while others say in a typical year their farms produced 1 to 2 tons of beans. Size of the farms, age of the trees, and agricultural practices all play a role in production. Prices can also fluctuate depending on everything from the quality of the beans to the buyer. A harvest of 150 kilograms selling at 320 Naira, or \$2.04 per kilogram, could earn a farmer about \$306 for a season of effort—not much when you consider that Mars is demanding as much as \$26.45 for just one 1 kilogram (35 oz) box of chocolate.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> http://www.nigerianstat.gov.ng/, under "latest releases", GDP Q3 2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2011-06-02/nigeria-s-cocoa-bean-exports-climbed-by-47-last-year-akingbola-says.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> http://www.lindtusa.com/category-exec/category\_id/21/nm/Bars



For 35 year old Sade Rafiu, a cocoa farmer who also serves as a village level trader, the system is unfair, "The farmers do the most work and they're realizing the least."

From nurturing the trees to drying the beans for sale, cocoa production is a labor-intensive pursuit. Both men and women are hired as farm laborers. While many struggle to survive on the income from cocoa, it is the women laborers who appear to fare the worst. Typically, they are hired to do only the lower-paying jobs. Agnes Gabriel, a 37-year-old migrant worker living in Ayetoro-Ijesa says that one of the jobs she does on local cocoa farms is lug water that will be mixed with chemicals to protect trees from pests. Other tasks include removing the beans from their pods during harvest time, carrying them to the site where they will ferment and then helping with the drying process. For her efforts, she'll earn 500 Naira a day, or just over \$3. Farmers told us women are paid \$2-3 for a day's work while men, often doing a different set of tasks that include weeding, spraying, and harvesting, earn about \$7 per day.

Some argue that women do not deserve equal pay because they do different jobs that are less strenuous. But women are sometimes paid less even when they do the same work. "There are times when [women] could work on the same kind of jobs, such as shelling of the pods. But even then, you cannot pay them the same wages because the men work harder and longer than the women," said Aina Aluko, a 40-year-old cocoa farmer, teacher and mother of six. But women are regularly involved in 12 of the 19 key stages in cocoa production, and play a lead role in early plant care, fermentation and drying - activities recognized by the industry as critical to ensuring good yields and quality production. Even so, company policies do nothing to ensure women receive fair and equal compensation.

### Limited access to training

Women cocoa farmers say that training could help them increase productivity to earn more to help feed their families, but sessions are held only infrequently, sometimes they don't hear about them, and some said competing demands on their time keep women from attending. While women were not overtly excluded from these trainings, there are questions about how accessible to women they truly were.

Women describe work days that can start before dawn with household chores and march through until the evening meal, sometimes without a break for lunch. There are children to care for; small businesses to tend to, and farms to work on or oversee. Yet Oxfam's analysis of company policies saw no evidence that trainings are designed with such constraints on women's time in mind.

Jumoke Popoole a 35 year old farmer from Oke Agbede Oke says trainings used to be offered intermittently, but women didn't usually attend. But Popoole and other women said they would like training that would help her improve their productivity.

<sup>10</sup> http://api.ning.com/files/

zKGtTtKz5rpxD\*9tNGabealhAHvB1Cbk6qH\*lxh145eMOdc22y2DNq61l5eDFpNh0pMTu0Zw-E64DPQ\*GqKljLtemFTJJV7H/CocoaGenderreport UTZSolidaridad.pdf



# SONATE BRANDS

### Unequal access to land

Despite the Land Use Act of 1978—intended, in part, to encourage more equal access—land tenure in Nigeria generally follows customary law. Typically, under these systems, women have limited rights. According to 2008-2009 United Nations Human Development Report, just 36 percent of Nigerian women have access to farmland. And when it comes to ownership, women's participation is even more tenuous—and may even be declining.

"Nigeria's 80.2 million women have a worse chance in life than men," Hajiya Zainab Maina, Nigeria's minister for women affairs and social development, told a reporter for the Vanguard in July, 2012. "60 to 79 percent of the rural workforce is women, but men are five times more likely to own land." A 2012 report on gender in Nigeria noted that in 2006, just over 7 percent of women in the country owned land, compared to 38 percent of the men. For women, that figure had dropped from about 13 percent in 2003.

Adelaju Olaleye is one of the small percent of Nigerian women who own their own land. In her case, it was through inheritance that she got her roughly 2.5 hectares—a means of acquisition most often reserved for men in some regions of Nigeria. But since there were no appropriate males to whom her father could leave the land at the time, he chose to give it to her. And the gift—about 15 years ago-- changed her life.

"I have seen what good things people are doing with their land and I can also do," says Olaleye, who is now about 65 and lives in the village of Oke Agbede Isale. "I enjoy my life. I get money to do things in life. I have trained my children and most of the children are well off."

### **Unequal access to credit:**

Access to credit is essential for cocoa farmers to invest in fertilizers, pesticides and labor to help run their cocoa operations. Women told us there are not specific restrictions on women borrowing but with limited assets, women face limits in borrowing too. Yet Oxfam's analysis found that promoting equal access to credit is another gap in company policies.

Jumoke Popoole says it's easier for men to borrow money because they have property and they own land, while many women are dependent on their husbands. "Men could borrow more because they have bigger farms," explains Aina Aluko.

<sup>11</sup> http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2009/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> http://www.vanguardngr.com/2012/07/national-devt-why-we-must-invest-in-women-children-women-affairs-minister/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> http://www.britishcouncil.org/africa-ng-gender-report-2012-summary.pdf, page 20



Cocoa farmers often have to turn to village-level buyers for loans. The problem comes at harvest time: farmers who have borrowed from the village-level buyers are obliged to sell their beans back to those same buyers at rates they dictate, which are very low.

"There is nothing I can do," says Olaleye, "I have no control over the price. Whether I'm satisfied or not, I take the price as given." Adelaju says that the traders say the price is dictated from beyond and they can't do anything about it. "It seems for now we are powerless."

Typically cocoa farmers don't turn to banks for loans. Beatrice Olowe who owns a farm of about four acres, borrows from friends and relatives when she needs to. Omowumi Afolabi, the mother of five children who works on a cocoa farm she rents with her husband says she borrows from the local cocoa buyers, who will loan her cash or materials. But the money she borrows is on her husband's shoulders. Omowumi says they don't use a bank, and banks would say that they are not credit worthy. "The reason we have not been exposed to any other source [is] they will claim they don't know us. You don't feel comfortable giving to someone you don't know."



### **GENDER INEQUALITY IN COCOA FARMING IN BRAZIL**

In January 2013, Oxfam visited the southern region of Bahia State, in Brazil. We spoke to small-scale farmers from the Terra à Vista settlement in Arataca, established by the national Landless Movement 20 years ago and home to 50 low income families, which share 330 hectares of land. We also visited a farm in Gandú that works with sharecroppers and hired rural workers.

The recent history of cocoa production in south Bahia is one of hardship, as a devastating disease, known as "witch's broom" (Moniliophthora perniciosa), hit the region in the 1990s and early 2000's. Farmers' and workers' ability to make a living from cocoa deteriorated rapidly. Thousands of people left the cocoa fields, and the livelihoods of those who stayed are only now getting back on track.

### More women, less power

Composing 51% of the population, Brazil has slightly more women than men. But this dominance is not reflected in the economy. Only about 58% of the women have a paid job, much less than the 81% of men<sup>14</sup>.

According to the last Agricultural Census made by the official Brazilian Institute for Geography and Statistics - IBGE, 70% of the rural workers are men. When it comes to land ownership, only 12% of the country's five million properties are run by women <sup>15</sup>. As a result, the family budget is managed mostly by men, although women work hard on the fields and also in their households.

The Brazilian Government has taken action to increase women's say in family decision-making. Since 2003, in every new settlement for small holders the property is in the name of both husband and wife<sup>16</sup>. The federal program that grants loans to family farmers (PRONAF) has a special credit for women (PRONAF Mulher), although very little is actually granted. Also the Bolsa Família – the very successful conditional cash transfer program started by President Lula – is granted to women, empowering them and changing the power imbalance within the households. But the results in rural and urban areas are quite different: from 1995 to 2009, the number of women leading households jump from 24.8% to 37.8% in urban areas while it only goes from 14.9 to 19.9% in the rural ones<sup>17</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Censo Demográfico, IBGE, 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Censo Agropecuário, IBGE, 2006. Page 178. ftp://ftp.ibge.gov.br/Censos/ Censo Agropecuario 2006/Segunda Apuracao/censoagro2006 2aapuracao.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Ministry of Rural Development, 2003. Portaria № 981 de 02 de outubro de 2003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Retrato das desigualdades de Gênero e Raça, 4ª edição, IPEA, ONU Mulher, SPM e SEPIR, 2011

There is still a lot to be done, as was clearly demonstrated in the cocoa regions visited. In Arataca, IBGE estimates that there are around 700 rural properties. Only 60 of them (8%) are registered in the name of women. In Gandú this proportion is 10%.

### **Cocoa in Brazil**

The production of cocoa in Brazil represents 4.4% percent of the world total, making the country the 6th largest producer globally (and the biggest in South America)<sup>18</sup>. The total production during last season (2011/2012) was estimated at around 235,000 tons of cocoa <sup>19</sup>.

The main producing region is the south of Bahia State, which is responsible for 156 thousand tons of cocoa, around 63% of the total Brazilian production. However, although south Bahia is an important center of production, it has low productivity per hectare, and the farmers struggle to make a sufficient living from cocoa.

From 1989 onwards south Bahia faced a quick spread of "witch's broom" disease. The immediate impact was a fall in the cocoa supply, which led to broken contracts and resulted in agricultural companies leaving the region. The president of the Brazilian Cocoa Technical Chamber (linked to the Ministry of Agriculture) estimates that around 250,000 jobs were lost in 5 years because of the losses in the cocoa plantations.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> ICCO, 2011. <a href="http://www.icco.org/about-us/international-cocoa-agreements/cat\_view/30-related-documents/46-statistics-production.html">http://www.icco.org/about-us/international-cocoa-agreements/cat\_view/30-related-documents/46-statistics-production.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> IBGE/CEPAGRI, 2012.



Today, there are two main models of production, one based on independent family farmers (estimated in 55% of the total<sup>20</sup>) and another one based on the sharecrop system (estimated in 45%).

### "I help my husband in the cocoa field"

In 'Terra Vista' in the municipality of Arataca, Dona Cissi, 46, a small-scale cocoa farmer struggles to make a living. Although she has been working in cocoa plantations since she was a child (on her father's small farm) she has never managed to grow her business. "We only have money when we have cocoa. When cocoa is gone, everything is gone", she says.

Like many other women in Brazil, Dona Cissi does not refer to what she does in the fields as 'work'. Instead, she says that she 'helps' her husband in his work: "I help to plant, to take care of the seedlings, fill the bags with soil. I also help to plant the seedlings."

In a 2010 report<sup>21</sup>, the Brazilian Ministry of Agricultural Development stated that this "help" that rural women refer to has made them "invisible". Based on this *status quo*, many public policies inadvertently favor men. The private sector, too, has failed to pay attention to this critical work done by women, which is absolutely necessary for the quantity and quality of their supply especially for cocoa production.

Jucilene is a rural worker at a cocoa farm in Gandu. She is 29 years old and had her first child at age 16. Her husband, Antonio, is 20 years older than her, and was 35 when Jucilene first became pregnant. Jucilene and Antonio work as sharecroppers. As for all the contracts on the farm, their contract is in Antonio's name, but both work in the fields.

Jucilene's and Dona Cissi's stories are common in Brazil. While younger women are more likely to see themselves as potential leaders in cocoa production, older generations of women find it hard to acknowledge the key role they play. These generations suggest women are not deserving of recognition, training or investment. Jucilene, however, sees it differently: "I help with the harvest, breaking the pods, and with fertilization. Today, I help a lot. I am not sure what my husband would say, but I think that without my help he wouldn't manage." Antonio agrees . "My life without my wife would be difficult, because I would need to pay for someone to do her job. If I had to pay 10 reais [around USD \$5] a day for someone, this money will be missed at home."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Figures given by Durval Mello, president of the Brazilian Cocoa Technical Chamber (linked to the Ministry of Agriculture). January, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> BERTOLINE, Valéria. "Políticas Públicas para Mulheres na Reforma Agrária". IICA e NEAD/MDA. Brasília, 2010. http://www.iica.int/Esp/regiones/sur/brasil/Lists/DocumentosTecnicosAbertos/Attachments/424/Valeria\_Andrade\_Bertolini\_-\_\_NEAD\_Artigo\_Mulheres.pdf



### Companies' policies as part of the solution

Private companies often argue that such gender imbalance is a societal problem and not one that they can impact. But others disagree. According to the FAO, women are the main workforce in the fields of developing countries<sup>22</sup>, and in Brazil it is no different. Strengthening the rights of women cocoa farmers in Brazil would lead to the strengthening of cocoa production, helping to meet the increasing demand for good chocolate.

However, the link between companies and producers is still weak. Informal middlemen who purchase cocoa from farmers to sell to traders make it difficult for companies to assess who grew the cocoa they buy.

Mrs. Teresa da Silva Santos, a woman cocoa farmer from Arataca sums up the problem: "A great part of our cocoa yields go to the middleman. We need to find alternatives to that. We need to find ways of increasing the value of our cocoa. I am no longer willing to sell it so cheaply."

Strengthening this link would improve the situation for both men and women. However, as Solange Brito Santos, one of the women leaders in Terra Vista, explains this alone won't solve the problem. "One of the key disadvantages faced by women is the lack of participation in decision-making processes, for example in deciding what happens to the cocoa yields, and where it goes. Women don't feel that this is their business", she states.

Deisi, a settled farmer in Terra Vista and a young leader there, believes that companies can help, "We should seek partnerships with companies that could help us increase and improve our production and also help us in transporting and selling our cocoa." She also believes that women have a wider role in the cocoa production process, able to do the same jobs as men. "We also have the potential to get more women involved through training, so that we then have a final product to sell".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> FAO. "Women, agriculture and food security". http://www.fao.org/worldfoodsummit/english/fsheets/women.pdf

### **GENDER INEQUALITY IN COCOA FARMING IN IVORY COAST**

Oxfam's January 2013 trip to Ivory Coast included visits to eight communities in five regions, where we spoke with 15 women cocoa farmers on an individual basis and four men who work in cocoa cooperatives. Although they do not employ or control them directly, companies like Mars, Mondelez and Nestle depend on the hard work of these farmers. But there appears to be little visible evidence that the international food and beverage companies are making sufficient efforts to do their part to help alleviate the inequality endured by the women who grow their most precious ingredient. Following is a summary of what Oxfam learned about conditions for women cocoa growers in this pocket of Ivory Coast.



### **Cocoa in Ivory Coast**

Ivory Coast is the world's top cocoa exporter, producing about 35 percent of the world's crop.<sup>23</sup> Ivorian cocoa figures prominently in mass-produced foods like mainstream chocolate milk, hot cocoa powder, and candy bars sold by companies including Mars, Mondelez and Nestle. In Ivory Coast cocoa is more than a mere cash crop. It is, in many ways, the resource upon which the country has been built. The vast

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> ICCO Quarterly Bulletin of Cocoa Statistics, Vol. XXXVIII, No. 3, Cocoa year 2011/12



majority of cocoa production the country comes from small farms of less than 5 hectares in size.<sup>24</sup>

Although cocoa is a crucial part of Ivory Coast's economy, the industry is under threat in a couple of important ways. First, for the 2012-13 harvest, the Ivorian government set the price of cocoa beans at 725 CFA (about \$1.50) per kilogram. Ghana, just to the east, set its price per kilo about 25 percent higher, sparking concerns that cocoa farmers would seek to smuggle their crop across the border to earn a few dollars more.<sup>25</sup>

Second, there has been a surge in rubber growing, which many Ivorian farmers consider an easier and more profitable way to make ends meet. Olga Rosine Adou, a 38 year old woman cocoa farmer living in Agboville, told us: "Rubber is a great threat here to cocoa farming. Everyone is wanting to do it. Among other things, it produces every month. Some people are even destroying their cocoa fields to replace them with rubber. But I believe that if we can get well organized, cocoa will be more profitable in the end."

Adou is emblematic of another issue facing the Ivorian cocoa industry—the inequalities facing women farmers. Ivorian cocoa farms are, for the most part, owned and operated by men.<sup>26</sup> While women play essential roles in farming cocoa, Oxfam's on-the-ground reporting found that their work traditionally has been underappreciated, at best, completely ignored, at worst, and often underpaid.

While companies are winning extraordinary profits from chocolate products most cocoa workers internationally live below the \$2 per day poverty line, and Ivory Coast is no exception.<sup>27</sup> Fair trade certification efforts are underway and becoming widespread, but these certifications were never designed to specifically tackle gender inequality so their benefits have not always delivered the same results to women.

### Unequal access to cocoa cooperatives

Membership in cocoa growing cooperatives can afford growers significant benefits including access to training, fertilizer and insecticide as well as premiums paid at the end of harvest. But women told Oxfam that it is rare to find women in cocoa coops, especially in roles of leadership.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Page 11 Cocoa A lever for Development, BTC Trade for Development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/10/18/ozabs-cocoa-smuggling-idAFJOE89H01R20121018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> 15-25% estimated in Ghana and Ivory Coast according to this: http://api.ning.com/files/zKGtTtKz5rpxD\*9tNGabeaIhAHvB1Cbk6qH\*Ixh145eMOdc22y2DNq61I5eDFpNh0pMTu0Zw-E64DPQ\*GqKljLtemFTJJV7H/CocoaGenderreport\_UTZSolidaridad.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> ILO, Labour conventions and specifications, accessed at www.ilo.org



Bado, a 50 year old cocoa farmer says she would like to be in a coop, but so far has not been able to gain membership and the accompanying benefits. Bado lives in a cinderblock house with her brother and a few other relatives—six people in total—in a small village in eastern lvory Coast, near the border with Ghana that is about 90 minutes from the closest paved road. Her inability to gain membership thus far is striking in light of the fact that her son-in-law is the President of the local cooperative. "It's up to Oumar," she says. "I'll be a member as soon as he decides it."

Allouko says her farm could benefit from Oumar and the coop's help, "If he gives me the pesticides to help me pump my cocoa fields, my crop will do better. Often I don't have the means to do it on my own." Steps taken by companies- in coordination with suppliers and certification schemes- to enhance membership and leadership of women in coops could help women like Allouko.



Olga Adou also wanted to help organize cocoa farmers, so she started her own coop. The COOPASA cocoa cooperative was founded with 100 members in 2010 and now has about 300 of which about 30 are women including the director Epi Joelle Kouamela. Adou says it is difficult to find women farmers in cocoa coops but she desperately wants to forge a new path, "I hope other women will follow us. We want women to realize they can do whatever men can do." The COOPASA cocoa cooperative is seeking certification, but they cannot afford the startup costs.

### Men's work vs. Women's work

Some of the challenges facing women in the Ivory Coast are cultural. Even though women are regularly involved in 12 of the 19 key stages in cocoa production, and play a



lead role in tending the young cocoa trees and performing post-harvest activities, <sup>28</sup> cocoa farming is considered by some to be "man's work" off limits to women. The result is that at times women must rely on male laborers which can eat away at their income.

"Women don't really do the cocoa work," says Etchi Avla a 43 year-old mother of five who owns and manages her own cocoa farm in Botendé, a small village on a dirt road about 90 minutes from the nearest paved road. "From the very beginning it has always been men ever since the field has been there and when I needed to take care of it then I would call the men. My biggest problem is to prepare the field and encourage the men and thank them." Because many tasks are considered by some to be men's work, Alva relies on a male laborer, with whom she shares her crop at harvest time—she keeps two-thirds, and the laborer gets one-third.

But some question whether this division between men's and women's work should remain in place. "Women can do anything they want," says Olga Adou. "And women are taking more responsibility. And so if our government and authorities can realize that they shouldn't put us at the bottom like that."

### **Carrying household burdens**

A shift in opportunities available to women cocoa farmers will require steps by many actors in society to help balance the additional household burdens women face. Like many places around the world women in Ivory Coast frequently must juggle obligations, hardships and daily tasks that men do not have. These obligations can make it more onerous for women to earn a living.

"It's very difficult to do this work as a woman," says Adou. "Women have so much to do at home—cleaning the house and keeping up the courtyard, preparing meals, etc. Women are the first to get up in the morning and the last to get to bed at night. They are educating their children. It's really difficult. They need help to survive."

Aminata Diavala lives in Léléblé in a dark concrete house near the edge of town. She is 50 years old, and shares her home with seven people—children and adults who are relatives. Diavala owns her cocoa farm which covers two hectares of land she inherited from her mother. The cocoa trees are relatively recent, 8 years old, so she's planted bananas among the trees to help feed her family. Her husband, who was also a cocoa farmer, died a decade ago. She has 8 children, but most are grown and married and have moved elsewhere.

Diavala told us she gets up at 5am, sweeps the courtyard, straightens the house, and washes the dishes from the night before. Then at about 7-she doesn't always eat breakfast in the morning- she goes to the fields, about a mile past the outskirts of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> http://api.ning.com/files/

zKGtTtKz5rpxD\*9tNGabeaIhAHvB1Cbk6qH\*Ixh145eMOdc22y2DNq61I5eDFpNh0pMTu0Zw-E64DPQ\*GqKljLtemFTJJV7H/CocoaGenderreport UTZSolidaridad.pdf



village. Diavala herself does some of the work in the cocoa fields—weeding around the seedlings and vegetable gardening. But the cutting of the cocoa pods, etc, is reserved for men. She leaves to go home at 2pm where she prepares dinner all afternoon. Without electricity, running water or packaged foods this can be a demanding process which includes gathering water and firewood, preparing everything from scratch and slaughtering animals when they eat meat. In addition to caring for her farm, she's in charge of taking care of all seven people living in the house.

### Looking for partners in change

In spite of significant obstacles many women cocoa growers in the Ivory Coast continue to be ambitious, entrepreneurial leaders in their communities. If they can find willing partners in companies these women can be powerful agents for change creating opportunity for a new generation of farmers.

"As a woman I know that there are other women in other countries who would like to support us," says Etchi Avla. "As a woman when you see another woman is suffering you want to help." Support could help them pursue the better future they are seeking for their families. "I would like for my children to go to school and work," said Bado Allouko. "I would like the children to succeed and be able to work and make money."

"There are many things we want," Olga Adou said, when asked what international companies could do to help women cocoa farmers in Ivory Coast. "For example, we want to be trained, taught about what steps to take to do it well. We also need tools, equipment, machetes, motos, buckets, etc, to get the work done. If we had those things, it'd be easier. We also need pesticides and fertilizers to treat our farms."

"We want that these conditions to get better," said Adou. "We want men to understand that women can do what men do. Women are not inferior to men. Men must understand that. And I think that with international pressure, things will start to change."



### **GENDER INEQUALITY IN INDONESIAN COCOA PRODUCTION**

In January 2013 Oxfam visited four communities in Sulawesi, the most important cocoa growing region of Indonesia, as well as the industrial zone in Makassar, the main city. We spoke with more than 20 women and men who work as cocoa farmers and farm laborers and as workers in cocoa processing facilities. Although they do not employ or control them directly, companies like Mars, Mondelez and Nestle depend on the hard work of these individuals to ensure a continued supply of good quality cocoa. But there is little visible evidence that international food and beverage companies are making sufficient efforts to do their part to support those who produce their most precious ingredient. Women in particular face disadvantages. Following is a summary of what Oxfam learned about conditions for women in Indonesia's cocoa industry.

### Cocoa in Indonesia

Indonesia, a tropical country, is the third largest cocoa producer after Ivory Coast and Ghana, providing 15 percent of the world's cocoa supply<sup>29</sup>. Cocoa is the main source of income for over 1,400,000 smallholder farmers and their families in Indonesia. Smallholders contribute 93% of national production; the remainder comes from state-owned plantations and private estates.<sup>30</sup> But hunger and malnutrition is endemic in cocoa growing regions of Indonesia. Stunting, where children are too short for their age as a result of poor diet and poor health circumstances, has reached an alarming 40 percent in the cocoa growing areas of Indonesia.<sup>31</sup>

Women face inequality across the cocoa value chain. From processing facilities in Makassar where women face discrimination, to the village of Pussui where women farm workers earn 25% less for their work than men. In spite of these obstacles, women in Indonesia are doing everything they can to forge a better future for themselves and their families.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> ICCO Quarterly Bulletin of Cocoa Statistics, Vol. XXXVIII, No.3, Cocoa Year 2011/12, based on 2009/10 statistics.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> http://www.veco-ngo.org/sites/www.veco-ngo.org/files/blog/bijlage/indonesia-cocoa-case.pdf

<sup>31</sup> https://www.google.com/url?

sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&cad=rja&ved=0CDMQFjAA&url=https%3A%2F %2Fwww.securenutritionplatform.org%2FDocuments%2FGAIN\_Cocoa %2520publication.pdf&ei=wPIKUa32HdKo0AGHzoFQ&usg=AFQjCNF2BrL94u8OfwV\_4XnkP2XiOa bfzg&bvm=bv.41642243,d.dmQ



### Low and unequal pay

In the village of Pussui both men and women work tirelessly as farmers and farm laborers on cocoa farms. Men typically do the pruning, fertilizing, harvesting and carrying the sacks of harvested cocoa. Women are responsible for sanitation (cleaning and preserving), harvesting, cutting the cocoa pods and drying the cocoa.

Unlike many work environments where rumors about unequal pay for women are whispered about near the water-cooler, women in this farming village are well aware that they are paid less for their work. In fact a deal deciding that women receive \$1.55/ five hours (Rp.15,000) for their work while men get \$2.06/ five hours (Rp.20,000) was struck openly by representatives from both the women's and men's farmers group.

The difference in wages is explained as necessary because men's work is more physically demanding. But women's work is critical for the quality of the cocoa. Women also do many physically demanding tasks, like hauling water, to support cocoa farms and households, often for no pay at all.

Receiving 25% less than men for your work can add up fast, and women struggle to make ends meet. Sanawiyah a 40 year old widow with two children lives with her parents, and her sister and her sister's husband and their three children. She cannot afford to live on the income she makes from cocoa so in order to support her family, she maintains 5 goats and grows crops like rambutan, durian, peppers, pecans and bananas. She displays and sells the products in front of her house, sometimes in the market. When this still doesn't stretch far enough, she has to borrow money from the farmers' group to stay afloat so she can feed her family. "I have no savings," she says.

Paltry incomes, low cocoa prices and high risks because of increasingly extreme weather and other threats to cocoa crops are causing many farmers to doubt whether cocoa can sustain their families in the future. Siti a 40 year old farmer from the village of West Rappang says palm oil could replace cocoa if opportunities don't change. "If the price of cocoa continues to decline, I would rather grow and harvest palm oil". Marhanah, 43 years old and from the same village puts it directly: "Please tell the companies that if the price is not better, it will be difficult to produce in the future... If the welfare of cocoa farmers does not improve, especially for women, cocoa will be replaced." Villages across the region have been offered palm oil by companies looking for new sources of the crop. Most seem to be holding out for now, sticking with the familiarity of cocoa, but they are aware that parts of Sulawesi have shifted to palm oil production.

### Isolation, poor infrastructure, limited access to credit

Most women and men cocoa farmers find little support and are often isolated from public services, banks, hospitals, markets and schools by long distances and poor infrastructure. Farmers face difficulty accessing clean water and power is only available five hours every day. Roads to the farms and linking rural areas to cities are heavily damaged. Farmers say they never go to banks for loans to help buy tools or fertilizers



### SETIND THE BRANDS

because there is no public transportation and hiring a vehicle is too expensive. This also makes it challenging for farmers to sell their cocoa. Instead of being able to access the higher prices their cocoa would fetch in the nearby town, the poor roads and lack of transport mean farmers often have to settle for the lower prices offered by the village traders.

These challenges are borne more heavily by women for whom it is harder to make the journey to the market. Sumarni a 27 year old farmer from Batupanga Daala has 0.25 acres of land with 200 cocoa trees, while her husband has 0.5 hectares of land with 400 trees. She says she never travels far from her village. The distance to town is too far, hiring a car is costly, the roads are damaged and there is a lack of adequate public transportation.

Women also have more household burdens than men. After tending the cocoa fields in the morning, and coming home to take care of her husband and her two children, feed her flock of chicken and water her cow, Sumarni must also collect water. Every afternoon, she takes four jerry cans full of water (20 liters) and carries them the 10-15 minutes to the house along a hilly, steep path. During the dry season when the river is shallow, Sumarni has to dig as deep as 30 cm to get clean water. When the rains carry runoff to the river she has to go looking for other sources of clean water - for cooking and bathing for the whole family, including her in-laws. Working in the fields and doing domestic work is very time consuming, and Sumarni has little time for other activities, such as participation in training with the local farmers' group.

### **Exploitative working conditions**

\*Names have been altered to protect the identities of the workers. Oxfam's Behind the Brands scorecard does not assess company policies in factories.

Oxfam heard reports of exploitation and discrimination against women from across the cocoa value chain in Sulawesi including export factories where women who face problems while they work often have no way to complain or fight back.

Arti is a laborer at a cocoa exporting factory in Makassar. She says she has been working as a laborer in cocoa processing since 2008. She works without a legal contract, and is paid just Rp. 50,500 or \$5.25 USD per day. But Arti often goes for more than a week without receiving any wages at all, as she only gets called in when there is a stock of cocoa. The money she makes is less than the minimum wage<sup>32</sup> and does not stretch to cover the cost of food, water and her rent. She pays about \$15.50 per month for a dark and stuffy 2.5 x 2.5 square meter room made of galvanized aluminum in a workers compound.

Arti says she does not receive the legal rights that workers should get under Indonesian law, such as Worker's Social Security. She says she is often scolded and insulted by the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> The legal minimum wage in Makassar is Rp. 1,265,000 per month. For casual workers it is Rp. 60,238 per day, which is calculated by dividing the monthly minimum wage by 21 days.



supervisor at the factory who calls her an 'animal'. "We are scolded even though we work properly," said Arti. She even reported being hidden in the back of the plant when 'guests' from outside visit. "After the guests left I was asked to work again." Yet she says she does not dare to fight this discrimination. "I never complain, I take it for granted, for fear of being fired."

Munir works part-time at a cocoa exporting plant located in Makassar. Munir says the plant where he works has 34 male workers and no female workers. He says this is because some years ago the factory management fired all the women after some had been demanding their rights, such as wage increases and other worker protections, such as menstruation leave. This right under Indonesian employment law gives women the option of two days leave per month, and is aimed at those doing physically demanding jobs where long hours and overtime is the norm, such as factory workers. Many of these women suffer from anemia and especially during their periods they are particularly vulnerable and physically weak.

### Finding ways to scrape by

Even under difficult circumstances and with little assistance women are seeking ways to support their families by working together. Nasriyah, a 40 year old farmer from the village of Pussui has been the chairman of the women's farmer's group Siasayangngi since 2008. The group provides guidance to its 25 members, helping them diversify their crops and add new sources of income. The group plans training programs, creates "demonstration plots" and vegetable gardens, and teaches members skills for their home gardens.

The members are diverse and they work creatively to save, borrow money and take advantage of their vegetable gardens together - so that no members go hungry. Nasriya hopes that women farmers' hardships can be overcome by empowering women so they can thrive.



www.oxfam.ca/grow

Oxfam photo credits: George Osodi/Panos (1,2); Peter DiCampo (3,4,5)